

Big Lottery Fund Grant P188

**LIVELIHOODS FOR YOUNG PEOPLE
IN SIERRA LEONE**

February 2015 – June 2018



CARD, SIERRA LEONE

**IN PARTNERSHIP WITH
APT - ACTION ON POVERTY, UK**

FINAL EVALUATION

23rd April – 30th April 2018

Evaluator: Sue Coe, Development Consultant, UK

Contents

Abbreviations and Acronyms.....	3
Acknowledgements.....	3
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	4
INTRODUCTION	7
EVALUATION METHODOLOGY	9
ToR 2: ASSESS THE SUCCESS OF THE PROJECT IN MEETING ITS OUTCOMES, EXPECTED RESULTS AND INDICATORS (including any unintended outcomes - positive or negative).....	12
OUTCOME 1	12
OUTCOME 2	17
ToR 1: EVALUATE THE IMPACT OF THE PROJECT TO DATE ON INDIVIDUAL BENEFICIARIES, THEIR HOUSEHOLDS AND COMMUNITIES	19
ToR 3: IDENTIFY KEY CONTRIBUTING FACTORS WHICH HAVE ENHANCED AND/OR HINDERED THESE PROSPECTS.....	24
Outcome 1 trade skills training	24
Outcome 2 life skills training	27
Stipends and Loans	28
ToR 4: ASSESS THE PROJECT'S OVERALL PERFORMANCE IN TERMS OF RELEVANCE, EFFECTIVENESS, EFFICIENCY, ECONOMY (INCLUDING VALUE FOR MONEY) AND SUSTAINABILITY.....	29
Relevance	29
Economy and Efficiency	30
Effectiveness	30
Sustainability	31
ToR 5: IDENTIFY KEY LEARNING POINTS AND MAKE RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FUTURE OPERATIONS OF THIS AND SIMILAR PROJECTS.....	31
Stipends and loans	31
Gender considerations	32
Disability considerations	34
Recommendations for Future Work	35
APPENDIX 1 – Outcome 2 indicators – detailed markers information	37
APPENDIX 2 –Enterprises established by project trainees (end March 2018)	42
APPENDIX 3 – Evaluation timetable.....	43
APPENDIX 4 – List of people interviewed	45
APPENDIX 5 – Evaluation visit questions and stakeholder interview list.....	48
APPENDIX 6 – APT-CARD joint response to evaluation recommendations.....	51

Abbreviations and Acronyms

AIDS	-	Acquired Immuno-Deficiency Syndrome
BDS	-	Business Development Services
CBO	-	Community Based Organisation
CDW	-	Community Development Worker
DPO	-	Disabled People's Organisation
FAL	-	Functional Literacy
HIV	-	Human Immuno-deficiency Virus
IGA	-	Income Generating Activity
MFI	-	Micro-Finance Institution
MoU	-	Memorandum of Understanding
NGO	-	Non-government Organisation
PAC	-	Project Advisory Committee
PWD	-	People with disabilities
ToR	-	Terms of Reference

Acknowledgements

Many thanks are extended to all CARD staff, led by Sagestine Gandhi, for their support and organisation in arranging itineraries and meetings, gathering additional information requested during the visit, taking time to explain different aspects of their work, and accompanying me to project activities and meetings with individuals. Thanks also to Kevan Moll in APT in the UK for facilitating the visit, providing briefing materials and clarifications on questions which arose during the pre and post visit periods.

Acknowledgement and gratitude especially go to all the more than 100 people I met in project communities and at the CARD office. They generously shared their time, their opinions and experiences of their engagement with the project.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

“The project has helped sway young people away from violence, begging and commercial sex work. It has given them skills and hope for the future. They realise they have potential. They have developed some sense of unity.”

Government Youth Commissioner, Bo Region

The overall assessment of the project is that it has met most - and in some areas substantially exceeded – project targets. Of the seven project indicators, five have been achieved (including two significantly exceeded), one has been partially achieved and one is on track to be achieved by the end of the project. The project hasn't yet fully achieved its income targets by participants, though viewing this through the lens of substantial macro-economic challenge in Sierra Leone during the project's operation provides a key context. CARD are congratulated by the evaluator for their substantive achievements delivered through this project.

The Livelihoods for Young People in Sierra Leone project was designed to respond to economic, political and social instability amongst youths in Sierra Leone, based on an earlier successful UNDP-funded project in 2008. The first aim of the 41 month project was to vocationally train 1200 vulnerable young people in Bo and Kenema within communities by placing them with artisans working in 16 different trade types in order to enable 90% of youth trainees to have secure incomes post-training (either employment or running an enterprise) and 80% of them to earn above the poverty line, meeting the basic needs of themselves and their dependents. CARD supplemented the technical skills training with business management training and mentoring to the 1200 youth trainees and their 300 training artisans. The second project aim was to provide the 1200 youth trainees with improved life skills to enable improved opportunities and personal empowerment. The project targeted 1200 youths aged between 18 and 35, 60% males, 40% females, also an additional target of 6% disabled people.

The final evaluation was led by an external UK consultant (Sue Coe) and planned with APT and CARD. The evaluation process involved key documentation review, design of bespoke quantitative and qualitative data collection tools to supplement CARD's monitoring data, initial interviews with APT and the CARD Programme Manager, assessment of project quantitative data and an eight-day visit to Sierra Leone that included interviewing 109 people (65 male, 44 female) to assess project performance.

1200 trainees (100%) have completed/are about to complete training with their artisans and all progressed/are expected to progress to employment or self-employment. A total of 211 trainees (21%) have started a total of 96 individual or group enterprises since completing training. 11 trainees died after completing training (10 males, 1 female). A total of 1189 trainees remain or are expected to continue in employment or self-employment beyond the end of the project. Most are meeting their basic needs and many are meeting those of key dependents as well.

The female target participation target (40% of trainees) was not quite achieved (35% of trainees). Although underlying this four of the six zones did meet target (Bo Zone 1, Bo Zone 2, Kenema Zone 1, Kenema Zone 2). Bo Zone 3 (30%) and Kenema

Zone 3 (23%) had lower achievement rates of female trainees. The target for disability trainees was almost achieved (68 people/5.6% - 42 male/26 female). In addition, an important project innovation was that it recruited 19 disabled artisans (16 male, 3 female) and placed both disabled and non-disabled trainees with them.

Targets for post-training income have only been partially achieved. All are earning above USD33 per month; 55% are earning above the original project target of USD45 monthly; only 9% are currently reported to earn above the revised project target of USD68 per month. Multiple factors account for this, explored in the main report. Despite this, most basic needs were reported to being met.

All Outcome 2 life-skills training targets were comfortably achieved and substantially (more than double – nearly triple for literacy) over-achieved for functional literacy, HIV/AIDS awareness, and gender and human rights training. Huge positive impact has resulted, linked to these (mostly) successful training courses. Even though income goals for the project have not been fully met, it was clear through the evaluation interviews that life-skills training components of the project have been life-transformational for many participants, especially females.

The CARD project delivery model is sound and has been largely successful. Key accounting factors for this are engagement and support of key external stakeholders in the project; successful initial promotion to identify appropriate artisans and trainees; giving trainees a broad choice of trade skills to select from; clear selection criteria and MoUs all consistently and methodically applied and monitored; “hands-on” support and mentoring by the six zonal Project Officers who had extensive contact with trainees and artisans throughout the project; and good training materials, delivered using methodologies (especially in functional literacy, business management and HIV/AIDS awareness) to achieve positive impact. The success of including people with physical impairments, including recruiting some as training artisans, is a specific achievement to highlight.

The project has yielded a wide range of expected and unexpected positive impacts. These include increased income (including from safer livelihoods for those previously engaged in unsafe income earning such as commercial sex work, begging and gang theft); better financial support for basic needs of trainees and their dependents; substantially increased family and community respect and self-empowerment for trainees (especially women and disabled people); reunification of families; enabling goods and services in rural areas to be available closer to consumer homes, saving transport costs to urban centres; better self-care behaviour re. HIV/AIDS prevention; reduced juvenile delinquency, crime and violence; reduced stigma around HIV/AIDS; paying taxes and voting in the recent national election.

A significant unexpected positive impact reported through the evaluation interviews was the onward training already delivered by trainees of their trade and life-skills (especially functional literacy and HIV/AIDS awareness) learnt. This indicates an important multiplier effect of project activities is happening.

Women especially reported the hugely positive impact of the life-skills training – even in cases where income aspirations are not yet being achieved. Social cohesion through the peer groups with artisans was also important for the young women’s

empowerment. The impact on disabled people who have participated is also significant - the project has helped to economically improve the lives of disabled people and help change perceptions of their worth and value amongst their families and communities. For disabled people themselves, their training brought huge social support benefits, reduced isolation and improvement in well-being.

The biggest challenge cited universally in the evaluation process was the loans scheme and stipends provided by the project. This proved a complex area to unravel. The other main challenge identified was gender-balanced inclusion. Both areas are explored in the main report, alongside some considerations for CARD for future disability inclusion in its work.

The main recommendations for CARD for future work are:

- Most of the skills training model is strong and should be retained. Replication is recommended as funding opportunities allow.
- A review is recommended on participation and engagement levels of female youths and achieving more impact from gender rights training. It is recommended that CARD seeks to learn from and partner with women's' groups who are representative of, and have successful experience in, female participation and a strong practical approach to gender empowerment.
- The stipends and loans element of the model would benefit from review. Specific recommendations for consideration are:
 - Include financial background checks on artisans in future iterations
 - Review the collective responsibility of artisans and trainees to repay loans
 - Rename the "toolkit loan" to "training loan" to more accurately reflect its purpose
 - Review appropriate levels/length for both stipends and loans
- Review the gender and human rights training materials, to ensure they are consistent with standard best practice on gender aspects
- Partner with a representative group of women's rights and empowerment for advice and input on best ways to design and deliver training.
- Train and support CARD staff on gender rights and inclusion issues as a foundation for future gender empowerment and higher female participation in CARD programmes
- In future phases of work extend opportunities beyond people with physical impairments (hearing, visual, intellectual)
- Identify activities to mitigate and eliminate attitude and access barriers to help disabled people move into successful employment or businesses beyond skills training and other mentoring support
- Identify and mitigate additional gender considerations for women with impairments

INTRODUCTION

BACKGROUND TO PROJECT

The Livelihoods for Young People in Sierra Leone project, funded by the Big Lottery Fund, responded to a pressing need to maintain economic and political stability in Sierra Leone through aiming to reduce extreme poverty and support the rights of young people to access skills and resources in order to secure sustainable livelihoods for them and their families

Started in February 2015, the 41 month project (three years and five months) had a total budget of GBP498,183. Its aims were to empower 1,200 vulnerable young women and men in Bo and Kenema Districts through skills and business management training and into work. This included having access to tools to start their apprenticeships via a collective loan with their training artisan, and later start their own enterprises or scale up existing ones through a revolving loan fund established by the project. The project also aimed to improve life skills through the provision of training in functional literacy, HIV/AIDS awareness, and gender and human rights awareness.

The main beneficiaries were targeted to be poor and vulnerable young people aged between 18 and 35 years who had never been to school or dropped out of formal education and cannot read or write, including commercial sex workers, young mothers, disabled people and those living on the streets (including disaffected young men who were gang members). Of these, gender targets for the project were 60% male and 40% female, with an additional target of 6% disabled people. The project aimed for 80% of the 1200 trainees (960 youths) to earn incomes sufficient to meet their basic needs and live above the poverty line by the end of the project, calculated in original project design at a minimum of USD45 per month.

Modelled on an earlier UNDP-funded project in 2008 that provided skills training to young people through placements with local enterprises, the Livelihoods for Young People project was approved in late 2014. The start of the project coincided with the devastating Ebola outbreak in Sierra Leone that peaked between May 2014 and May 2015. Having been approved by the Big Lottery Fund at the height of the epidemic, the project's start was delayed to February 2015 when it was felt that situation within the project areas had improved sufficiently to enable it to function meaningfully. Neither CARD nor APT felt that the Ebola outbreak had affected the project's plans or relevance and as such, no changes to the design or outcomes were made. Although there were no changes, two factors that did impact upon the project included a surplus of applications from potential trainees as young people who were close to the end of their education when schools were closed for a year decided not to return once they re-opened, meaning that the majority of trainees were school drop-outs. The closure of educational institutes also led to an upsurge in pregnancies among young and single mothers, many of whom were also project beneficiaries. While none of the project's six rural areas were considered Ebola hot-spots, the epidemic inevitably took its toll on owners of small businesses everywhere, along with all other sections of society. As such, one additional outcome of this project became to contribute to the rebuilding of entrepreneurial capacity in Bo and Kenema Districts through business training and mentoring support to the artisans who accommodated young people for training.

The project has worked in two urban areas - Bo and Kenema towns and six satellite villages in rural areas: Gbaima, Gerihun and Dambala in Bo District and Blama, Hangha and Gegbwema in Kenema District. Both towns were split into three zones that were closest to one of the satellite villages (all within a 30km radius), creating a total of six project zones comprising part of Bo or Kenema town and an outlying satellite. One CARD Project Officer has been responsible for each zone, with those in Bo operating from the CARD office while a small project office was established in Kenema. The rest of the project team has comprised a Project Co-ordinator, Monitoring and Evaluation Officer, Accountant, Office Assistant and a guard.

The project used an informal apprenticeship model of providing skills training to trainees by placing them in existing local enterprises in 16 different trades for periods of between six months to three years, depending on the trade. The owners of those businesses, known as artisans, received a payment of SLL50K per month over the full course of the training while trainees received an allowance of SLL20K for their first three months to cover travel and lunch, after which time they were expected to cover their own costs from their earnings. All artisans took on four trainees at a time, a toolkit loan was provided by the project to cover the costs of purchasing additional tools and equipment as well as raw materials, much of which was expected to be wasted as the trainees learnt a new craft. The value of toolkit loans varied according to the trade and were calculated based upon covering 30% of the tools, equipment and raw materials needed to establish a new business in the trade area. The 30% amount was based on an expectation that increased income as a result of additional staff would cover replacements for wasted materials and damaged tools. As toolkit loans were repaid, it was expected that the fund would be converted into a business loan fund to support newly trained people to start their own business or scale up an existing one with their former trainer.

The two project outcomes and main indicators were:

1. Vulnerable young people are trained within the community to sustain their own enterprise, participate in a joint enterprise or secure employment, generating the equivalent income of USD45 per month for their (and their dependants') basic needs

1.1 1,200 vulnerable young women and men (480 female & 720 male) in Bo and Kenema Districts have accessed new skills to generate a livelihood

1.1a 1,080 vulnerable young women and men (432 female & 648 male) in Bo and Kenema Districts reducing their poverty through securing employment or running an enterprise

NB This indicator (1.1a) was not in the original grant offer or annual report template to the Big Lottery Fund, it was volunteered and reported on by APT and CARD in their monitoring as additional impact data.

1.2 960 beneficiary men and women (384 female & 576 male) earning incomes to meet their basic needs and live above the poverty line (at least USD45 per month)

NB This indicator had a revised poverty line figure of USD68 voluntarily introduced by CARD and APT at the mid-point in the project, to reflect the significantly shifting macro-economic situation in Sierra Leone during the project's duration.

- 1.3 960 young people and their six dependents (including children, elderly relatives etc.) with access to their basic needs (e.g. health care, education, meals per day).
2. **Vulnerable youths will have improved life skills, including HIV/AIDS awareness, functional literacy, rights and gender awareness, leading to improved opportunities and personal empowerment**
 - 2.1 1,200 young women and men (480 female & 720 male) with better understanding/awareness of HIV/AIDS, health and safety, gender rights and obligations (compared to the baseline)
 - 2.2 840 young women and men (350 female & 490 male) with functional literacy
 - 2.3 400 women and 540 men with improved opportunities and greater sense of self-respect demonstrated by reporting greater independence and participation

EVALUATION METHODOLOGY

The specific Terms of Reference (ToR) for this evaluation were as follows:

- Evaluate the impact of the project to date on individual beneficiaries, their households and communities (ToR 1)
- Assess the success of the project in meeting its outcomes, expected results and indicators (including any unintended outcomes - positive or negative) (ToR 2)
- Identify key contributing factors which have enhanced and/or hindered these prospects (ToR 3)
- Assess the project's overall performance in terms of relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, economy (including value for money) and sustainability (ToR 4)
- Identify key learning points and make recommendations for future operations of this and similar projects (ToR 5)

The evaluation had a number of strands:

1. Document review of key project design documents and reports, APT-written trip reports and APT-led Mid Term Review. Also materials (records, training materials, data collection forms) kept by CARD in their offices and used in their project work.
2. Design of quantitative and qualitative data collection information needed for the evaluation, supplementing CARD's monitoring data on project progress. Including the design of a Key Informant Interview question list, adapted for different sets of project stakeholders. See Appendix 4 for details.
3. Initial (separate) interviews with APT Programme Manager and CARD Programme Manager pre-visit (on Skype) for 1.5 hours each.
4. Visit to Sierra Leone for 8 days (see Appendix 3 for schedule):
 - i. Initial workshop with staff - structured discussions with nine staff on project achievements and challenges plus gender-targeting issues

- ii. Field visits to five of the six project zones (two in Bo and three in Kenema). Key Informant Interviews (from the designed questionnaire) with individuals and groups across main sections of project work in each place (non-disabled and disabled male and female trainees; artisans; project steering committee members which encompassed Government support and literacy trainers as well as trainees and artisans; available local leaders).

NB A total of 109 people (65 male, 44 female) were met and interviewed by the evaluator across the five zones during the field visit, representing a cross-section of project work. Specifics given in Appendix 3 with the field visit programme and list of names

- iii. Workshop to give initial main evaluation findings to CARD staff and receive pertinent feedback

5. Draft report sent to APT and CARD

6. Finalisation of project evaluation report

Limitations of the evaluation process

The evaluation process was scoped to fit the resources and timescales available to CARD, APT and the evaluator. This led to some limitations in coordinating suitable dates for all three parties but this had relatively minimal impact on the final process due to the volume of interviews covered on field visiting days.

The evaluation report has been completed one month before the end of the project. The situation reflected to the evaluator in field visit interviews and data recorded in the final evaluation report is for work to end April 2018 (two months before the end of the project). Some key activities are due for completion in the final two month period – including completion of 252 trainees (126 trainees on 3 year training courses plus 126 trainees who started their training later into the programme on auto-electrician, carpentry, motorbike mechanic, tailoring and refrigeration technician courses) and loan repayment recovery work. The final project report to the Big Lottery Fund is scheduled to present the full data set for the entire length of the project.

Privacy of some meetings was limited. For practical reasons they were organised in trainee work places (often in markets and public places) and with the artisan often present. Natural curiosity of some bystanders was a factor in some interviews. This might have impacted some responses. In a few specific cases the evaluator adjusted her question list to ensure appropriate safeguarding issues for the trainees as it was not known who all the bystanders listening into conversations were. However, the overall responses were relatively consistent across interviews for the evaluator to have sufficient confidence in the main findings.

Three former trainees with their artisan in Bo. Two still work with him in his shop, one has set up his own business – his former artisan still mentors him.

All the trainees were gang members before joining the CARD organised training. They now make good livings from electronics and mobile repair work. This has replaced harassment and stealing as their income source.

The artisan took risks (including to his personal safety) but persisted in supporting and caring for these young dynamic men, who now support their families and pay taxes and want to be good citizens



ToR 2: ASSESS THE SUCCESS OF THE PROJECT IN MEETING ITS OUTCOMES, EXPECTED RESULTS AND INDICATORS (including any unintended outcomes - positive or negative)

OUTCOME 1

Vulnerable young people are trained within the community to sustain their own enterprise, participate in a joint enterprise or secure employment, generating the equivalent income of USD45 per month for their (and their dependants') basic needs

Outcome Achievement recorded against indicators:

Indicator	Achievement	Verifying document (s)
<p>1.1 1,200 vulnerable young women and men (480 female & 720 male) in Bo and Kenema Districts have accessed new skills to generate a livelihood</p>	<p>Total – achieved 1200 trainees trained across 16 trades.</p> <p>Gender targets – nearly achieved 424 females/35%, 776 males/65%</p> <p>Disability trainee target – almost achieved 68 people/5.6% - 42 males/26 females compared to target of 72 people/6%</p> <p>In addition, the project also worked with 19 disabled artisans (16 male, 3 female), placing trainees (disabled and non-disabled) trainees with them</p> <p>Eleven of the trainees died after the completion of their training (10 males and 1 female) so 1189 trainees currently are continuing</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Trainee register –first and second placement form • Quarterly zonal officer reports • CARD reports compiled to send to APT
<p>1.1a 1,080 vulnerable young women and men (432 female & 648 male) in Bo and Kenema Districts reducing their poverty through securing employment or running an enterprise</p>	<p>Total – on schedule to overachieve project target by 10% All trainees continuing/expected to continue working beyond their training period.</p> <p>100% of completed trainees (937 – 368 female and 569 male) are in employment or self-employment having completed training.</p> <p>NB: 252 trainees scheduled to complete in June 2018. All expected to remain with their artisan, establish an enterprise or secure employment elsewhere, consistent with results from other trade skills training</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Data sheets compiled by Zonal Officers • Quarterly collated reports by Zonal Officers • CARD reports to APT • APT reports to donor

	<p>Of those who have completed training. 726 (265/36.5% female & 461/63.5% male) are in employment (582/80% with their former artisan) & 211/21% have started 96 new businesses (56 group: 93 male, 7 female; 40 individual enterprises: 14 male and 26 female). These include some promising and impressive businesses who are already training more young people and generating benefits to a wider range of people</p> <p>11 trainees (10 male and 1 female) died after training was completed</p> <p>Gender balance – nearly achieved. For the same reasons as indicator 1.1</p>	
<p>1.2 960 beneficiary men and women (384 female & 576 male) earning incomes to meet their basic needs and live above the poverty line (at least USD45 per month)</p>	<p>Partially achieved</p> <p>INCOME RECEIVED All trainees are earning income post-training (based on sample survey), though not yet to levels targeted in the project design:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Original figure of USD45 - partially achieved • Revised figure of USD68 - significantly under-achieved <p>NB Poverty line figure voluntarily adjusted by APT/CARD from USD45 to USD68 per month in January 2017 to reflect significantly changed economic conditions in Sierra Leone in 2015-16.</p> <p>937 people (368 female, 569 male) earning between USD33 – USD105 per month:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Below USD45 (minimum USD33) 423 (180 female, 243 male) = 45% • Between USD45 - USD68 430 (180 female, 250 male) = 46% • Above USD68 (maximum 105USD) 84 (8 female, 76 male) = 9% <p>BASIC NEEDS COVERED Mostly achieved. From the sample survey the following designated basic needs were reported as being met:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Feeding at least two meals per day Female- 364 (99%); Male -566 (99.5%) 	<p>Sample survey: 25% sample size of 300 trainees (Male 108, Female 92) of the total 1200, evenly spread across the 6 project zones and rural/urban areas i.e. 50 surveyed in each zone</p>

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Rent Payment Female -224 (61%); Male – 348 (61%) • Pay family medical bills Female -320 (87%); Male - 490 (86%) • Pay school fees Female – 320 (78%); Male – 334 (59%) • Buy Clothing Female -368 (100%); Male – 563 (99%) • Support to other relatives Female – 276 (75%); Male – 487 (86%) 	
<p>1.3 960 young people and their six dependents (including children, elderly relatives etc.) with access to their basic needs (e.g. health care, education, meals per day)</p>	<p>Significantly achieved.</p> <p>BASIC NEEDS COVERED From the sample survey the following designated basic needs were reported as being met:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Feeding at least two meals per day Female- 364 (99%); Male -566 (99.5%) • Rent Payment Female - 224 (61%); Male – 348 (61%) • Pay family medical bills Female -320 (87%); Male - 490 (86%) • Pay school fees Female – 320 (78%); Male – 334 (59%) • Buy Clothing Female -368 (100%); Male – 563 (99%) • Support to other relatives Female – 276 (75%); Male – 487 (86%) 	<p>Sample survey: 25% sample size of 300 trainees (Male 108, female 92) of the total 1200, evenly spread across the 6 project zones and rural/urban areas i.e. 50 surveyed in each zone</p>

Toolkit loans and business loan repayment rates

Figures captured by CARD and verified by APT, to end of April 2018 report:

Toolkit loans

83.5% of monies lent repaid/on track to be repaid by end June 18

55.4% of numbers of toolkit loans repaid/on track to be repaid by end June 18

Business loans

73.3% of monies lent repaid/on track to be repaid by end June 18

22.5% of numbers of business loans repaid/on track to be repaid by end June 18

Total

79.8% of all monies lent out across toolkit and business loans repaid/on track to be repaid by end June 18.

NB in latter stages of the project, CARD staff elected to focus their loan repayment strategies on higher value loans, hence the discrepancy in numbers between actual monies repaid and numbers of loans repaid in full.

Comments on Outcome 1 evaluation findings

Indicators 1.1: 1,200 vulnerable young women and men (480 female & 720 male) in Bo and Kenema Districts have accessed new skills to generate a livelihood and 1.1a: 1,080 vulnerable young women and men (432 female & 648 male) in Bo and Kenema Districts reducing their poverty through securing employment or running an enterprise

These both confirm **substantial** success for the CARD project team in their core “driver” – to recruit, retain and place 1200 young people into trades with skills and enable them to earn incomes.

In the first three months of the project 30 trainees initially recruited dropped out of their training. All were replaced by people from a reserve list. These 1200 have then completed/are about to complete their training. This is an impressive 100% retention rate of trainees in their training programmes. Sadly 11, trainees died after completing training (10 males and 1 female). Of 1189 remaining there has been a 100% (to-date) success rate of trainees continuing in their trades. The majority of trainees have remained with their artisan though 96 new individual and group enterprises have also been established.

Business Management Training

This course, designed and written by CARD’s Programme Manager, was delivered to trainees and their artisans by CARD staff. As well as technical components of business management, it included aspects of positive group dynamics and leadership qualities deemed important to run successful businesses. Follow-up mentoring support after course content was delivered was a core part of CARD’s model of delivery.

The course received widespread spontaneous positive feedback and recollection of content during most evaluation interviews and clearly had positive impact for those who went through the programme.

Indicator 1.2: 960 beneficiary men and women (384 female & 576 male) earning incomes to meet their basic needs and live above the poverty line (at least USD45 per month)

The levels of income attained by trainees at the end of the project has not yet achieved what the project targeted in its design. 252 trainees are due to complete project training beyond the time of writing this report. Many are in higher value traders (for example car mechanic repairs) which is expected to see the final figure increase from current records.

However, a significant success of the project to note is that 100% of the trainees have continued in the trades they chose to learn about, and all are receiving an income from these trade skills (so none have abandoned their elected trade skill in favour of an alternative).

The sample survey and field interviews established most trainees seem to be covering most of their basic needs. Most trainees (91%) are reported to receive below the revised poverty income benchmark of USD68 per month. 55% are

reported to be receiving above the original poverty income benchmark of USD45, and everyone is reported to be receiving USD33 or higher per month.

A key point to note is that some significant success has been generated amongst the 96 individual and group enterprises established by trainees at the end of their training with their artisans. There are some promising and successful businesses within them, some of whom are already replicating their experience in the CARD project by training other youths. See Appendix 2 for the list of individual and group enterprises established as at April 2018.

Gender targets not fully achieved

This issue is considered in more detail later in the report. A general comment on Outcome 1 is that whilst the project had some good success with female participants it did not quite manage to achieve its self-set targets of 40% female participation as trainees – overall the split was 35% female to 65% male participation against targets of 40%/60%. CARD deliberately set this gender target above Government gender targets, which are 30% female/70% male and wanted to aim to exceed Government expectation rates.

Looking at zonal variations, these total numbers are skewed by lower female participation rates in Bo Zone 3 (30%) and Kenema Zone 3 (23%). In the other 4 zones average female participation rates was virtually at target levels (39.3%) – Of particular note is Kenema Zone 2 which achieved the highest female participation rate at 49%.

Business management training impact

The course received widespread spontaneous positive feedback and recollection of content during most evaluation interviews and clearly had positive impact for those who went through the programme.

Indicator 1.3: 960 young people and their six dependents (including children, elderly relatives etc.) with access to their basic needs (e.g. health care, education, meals per day)

The sample survey (of 25% of participants), combined with the evaluator interviews, show a picture of significantly more basic needs being met for trainees and their dependants compared to pre-project. All interviewees reported increased ability to meet basic needs – most meeting all of them on the money they have (still often below official poverty lines).

Linked to this ability to meet basic needs were explicitly-expressed sense of pride at being able to do so. For female trainees, a number of those interviewed who had previously been commercial sex workers and/or had been sexually exploited and abused due to their low economic status said this no longer happened to them.

Another particular area of note are those trainees who were street-begging before joining the project – many of them were disabled people. All have given up begging and although most are on very limited incomes, none have felt a need to return to street-begging for income.

A former female trainee who is now a businesswoman, she needed to support her younger siblings after their parents died. She already has 4 trainees as she wants to give other young women the chance she was offered by the project. They all produce beautiful embroidery products



OUTCOME 2

Vulnerable youths will have improved life skills, including HIV/AIDS awareness, functional literacy, rights and gender awareness, leading to improved opportunities and personal empowerment

Outcome Achievement recorded against indicators:

Indicator	Achievement	Verifying document (s)
<p>2.1 1,200 young women and men (480 female & 720 male) with better understanding/awareness of HIV/AIDS, health and safety, gender rights and obligations</p>	<p>Health and safety course targets - achieved</p> <p>HIV/AIDS, human rights and gender courses - substantially over-achieved: target exceeded by 137%:</p> <p>2,849 people (895 female & 1,954 male) with better understanding of HIV/AIDS, gender rights & obligations</p> <p>1,200 trainees (424 female & 776 male) with better understanding of occupational health & safety</p> <p>See Appendix 1 for detailed markers</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Data record sheets of training by Zonal Officers • Monthly reports of HIV/AIDS focal person • Quarterly reports by zonal staff • Report by CARD to APT • Sample survey • Mid Term Review • Evaluation

<p>2.2 840 young women and men (350 female & 490 male) with functional literacy</p>	<p>Substantially over-achieved – exceeded target by 163%</p> <p>2206 people (655 female and 1551 male) with functional literacy i.e. ability to read and write work related orders, instructions, receipts & notes</p> <p>See Appendix 1 for detailed markers</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • CARD reports to APT • APT reports to donor • Reports of FAL Facilitators for attendance • Sample surveys for knowledge and application • Test scripts of FAL participants
<p>2.3 400 women and 540 men with improved opportunities and greater sense of self-respect demonstrated by reporting greater independence and participation by the end of the project</p>	<p>Achieved</p> <p>937 people (368 female & 569 male) reporting improved opportunities, greater independence and/or participation with 369 documented examples from women</p> <p><u>Participation in family decision taking</u> Female –364 (99%); Male-552 (97%)</p> <p><u>Participate in community decision taking</u> Female –195 (53%); Male- 376 (66%)</p> <p><u>Represent community at other levels</u> Female –169 (46%); Male –185 (50%)</p> <p><u>Hold key community position</u> Female –96 (26%); Male –176 (31%)</p> <p><u>Mobilise, manage, control own resources</u> Female –337 (92%); Male – 952 (97%)</p> <p><u>Have own spouse and family</u> Female –239 (65%); Male –376 (66%)</p> <p><u>Now speak in public without being shy</u> Female –368 (100%); Male-563 (99%)</p> <p><u>Own self/group enterprise</u> Female –125 (34%); Male -239 (42%)</p>	<p>Sample survey</p> <p>Project records from Zonal Officer reports of individual documented examples from women</p>

Comments on Outcome 2 evaluation findings

The project has been very successful in achieving its Outcome 2 targets, especially the components of delivering functional literacy training and HIV/AIDS awareness training. Targeted numbers to receive training have been substantially exceeded. This is because those trainings were opened to other interested youths who weren't part of the Outcome 1 skills training programme but expressed interest to attend, plus artisans.

ToR 1: EVALUATE THE IMPACT OF THE PROJECT TO DATE ON INDIVIDUAL BENEFICIARIES, THEIR HOUSEHOLDS AND COMMUNITIES

A wide range of examples of specific impacts directly attributable to the project's work given to the evaluator during interviews. Many items on the list below were reported multiply in interviews in most locations. They include:

- Earning income (if no income earned previously)
- Increased income (if previously in low income or seasonal trades like petty trading and farming)
- Earning income from safer livelihoods (for those who were begging, in commercial sex work, formerly dependant on patriarchs in return for sexual favours, former gang members who were thieves)
- In rural and peri-urban locations new businesses have been formed that enable people to buy more locally than previously – reducing transportation costs to reach markets to buy goods and services
- No longer begging on streets for income, gaining some income from trade skills instead
- Enjoyment of learning from the different courses as well as trade skills
- Improved income
- Increased respect from community (especially women and disabled people)
- Being consulted on opinions by families and communities – and opinions being expressed being listened to and taken on board
- Others now ask trainees for money (including those who formerly were begging), rather than the other way around
- Extra clothes – greater sense of self-pride and self-esteem resulting from this
- Potential to return to full-time education with increased income and self-esteem (having lost both parents at a young age so stopping school as a direct consequence)
- Taking care of personal basic needs – food, clothes, rent
- Contributing to basic needs of dependants and other family members
- Moving from direct parental support to independence and self-support for economic needs
- Reunited with family members
- Marriage
- Having children as it was now possible financially and practically
- Positive impacts from learning functional literacy (written and numeracy) – better ability to run business/not be cheated by clients; support to children's school homework; increased self-esteem
- Paying taxes to Government
- HIV/AIDS awareness – reduction from multiple to single sexual partner; awareness not to have multiple sex partners; use of condoms; not sharing blades and needles (men's shaving etc.)
- Promoting messages on HIV/AIDS to family and community members to "spread the word" on HIV prevention behaviour and practice
- Having a skill which trainees have a passion for and also can make money from – enjoyable work (especially cited in bike mechanics, tailoring, embroidery, catering, hairdressing)

- Desire to give back to community by sharing training messages with as many as possible in future, and take on trainees themselves to share their learning
- Affirming relationship (for some) with their training artisan who has been a role model, inspirational, and encouraged traits of unity and social concern amongst trainees
- Training also covered Ebola prevention – the increased practice of hand-washing and associated health benefits from better hygiene practices were cited by some as a positive impact
- Supporting younger siblings and parents back at home villages (where trainees moved to urban locations to work with artisans) for school fees, medical and food bills. Also bringing some family members to their newly established group enterprises as trainees
- Rent rooms and live independently – better living conditions
- No longer engaging in commercial sex work for income – earned income enabling basic needs of herself and family dependants, plus taking on several trainees
- Setting up an enterprise post-training has enabled independence, choice and increased self-esteem
- Training other young people in trade and life skills, based on training received through CARD project
- Many youths were based at home, not working or having focused activity in their lives. There was concern that a lack of opportunities and channelling them towards productive work could fuel negative economic and social consequences that have previously negatively impacted Sierra Leone (in a conflict and post-conflict context). The 100% retention rate of youths in skilled trade work represents huge economic and social impact for them as individuals, and the example they all provide to other youths in their family and social spheres for future aspirations
- Life skills training courses and the pro-active engagement of CARD project zonal officers have helped encourage greater community dialogue & cohesion
- Recipients of functional literacy are teaching others their skills
- Disabled people – the project has helped to economically improve the lives of disabled people and help change perceptions of their worth and value amongst their families and communities. Further, the project has helped improve self-esteem amongst disabled people who have participated, many of whom believed that begging was their only income option.
- Reduced crime – some participants were committing crimes in gangs (some joined gangs after becoming orphaned and homeless in the Ebola epidemic), they are now working or running their own businesses and paying taxes
- Participation in democracy – after the human rights training, registering to vote and then voting in the recent March 2018 national election.
- Reduction in violence amongst youths who were previously involved in crime.
- Life skills training have helped healthier personal and community relationships develop
- Moved from reliance on hand-outs to self-reliant incomes
- Reduction in commercial sex work in targeted areas
- Those with dependants better managing their families, homes and owning their responsibilities
- Reduced juvenile delinquency in targeted communities

- People going voluntarily for HIV testing, without needed to be encouraged to do so.
- Reunification of families – both youths returning home having left to live on the streets, and acceptance back of disabled people previously excluded
- Reduction in stigma around HIV/AIDS which impacted many affected individuals and families – more general acceptance and inclusion of those with HIV as having capacity to live long lives, gain skills and have good health
- Better community perceptions and self-empowerment for women
- For disabled people, being trained together brought huge social support benefits, reduced isolation and improvement in well-being. The unity and social support from being in a group helps deal with struggles with a sense of support and togetherness

Improvement in access to basic needs and self-empowerment

Impacts on changed abilities to meet basic needs for themselves and dependents was a common theme in interviews. Linked to this ability to meet basic needs was explicitly-expressed sense of pride at being able to do so. For many, increased economic income has brought additional status, pride and respect from others around them. Some reported being able to go home and being consulted in family and community decisions. Some of the disabled people interviewed in particular mentioned greater inclusion by family and community members who had previously excluded and marginalised them.

For female trainees, a number of those interviewed had previously been commercial sex workers and/or had been sexually exploited and abused due to their low economic status. All of those who mentioned these elements to the evaluator in interviews said this no longer happened to them.

Another particular area of note are those trainees who were street-begging before joining the project – many of them were disabled people. All have given up begging and although most are on very limited incomes, none have felt a need to return to street-begging for income. Increased sense of respect and self-worth were reported to the evaluator in interviews as a direct consequence of this.



Motorbike repair shop run as a group enterprise established by 4 male youths (3 pictured here) who trained with an artisan having moved from rural villages to Kenema town. They enjoyed training together and became friends. After finishing they decided to set up in business together with a business loan from the project.

Aged between 18 and 26, they are already making good monthly incomes, living independently and sending money back to their villages to support siblings and parents. They are already training five other youths.

They are quickly establishing a reputation for quality work – last year they entered a local motorbike mechanics competition and won,

which they are very proud of. Winning also helped build their marketing and reputation.

They are ambitious and have plans to expand, wanting to take on more trainees to also offer opportunities for employment and incomes. In future they want to build their own houses, support more family members and eventually have their own families. One (aged 19) has already bought some land to build a house on in future.

Collective impact of Outcome 2 life skills training activities

The spontaneous recollection, positive impact and changed behaviours as a result of the functional literacy and HIV/AIDS awareness course came through very strongly in evaluation interviews. The evaluator reviewed available written course content for these two courses – both had strong and effective training materials.

An important finding to highlight is that a number of interviews with female trainees demonstrated that although they may not have fully achieved the income goals targeted by the project (as reported under indicator 1.2 and 1.3), most females expressed strong recollection of the life skills training work and specific positive changed impacts as a result of information learnt in these trainings. This is transformational for them in giving greater knowledge and control over their bodies and life situations. They also reported sharing this information and learning with other people in their communities. The life skills and human rights training have created a multiplier effect, and substantially more people are likely to have benefitted from the project's course information that has been onward-shared by trainees.

Functional literacy

Many trainees, and some artisans, expressed the difference having some literacy and numeracy made – in terms of managing their businesses, helping others (especially their children doing school homework), increased personal pride, and increased respect received from others.

HIV/AIDS

Most interviewees spontaneously expressed specific HIV-prevention changes they had made to their lives directly as a result of the learning from this course. The sample survey findings also verify the impact and effectiveness of this course (see Appendix 1 for detailed feedback)

Gender and human rights

The impact of the human rights and gender training was less evident from the evaluation interviewing process compared to the other courses. More recollection and awareness of this training was expressed by female compared to male interviewees. Most male interviewees struggled to recall the gender and rights course – and if they did, largely focused on the non-gender aspects of the training (like the right to vote, the importance of paying taxes, and personal human rights they were entitled too).

This being said, some positive impacts were reported to the evaluator from this training by a number of trainees. This included voting, paying taxes and the knowledge that women should not experience domestic abuse. A particularly strong example was offered by a young woman who brought her voting card from the recent national election to the evaluation interview – she said she would not have voted if

she had not learnt about it in the training, and proudly took her place to vote on the day of the recent national elections. The engagement of the critical youth vote in the future of the Sierra Leone nation is an important positive additional impact of the project.

After receiving human rights training about the right to vote from the CARD project, this young woman (a trainee weaver) was inspired and determined to register to vote and exercise her democratic rights.

The recent national election in March 2018 has just happened, and a new President voted in to Sierra Leone. She is very proud to have voted for the first time and still carries her voting registration card with her.



Unexpected changes and impacts

The main unexpected change reported by interviewees was the onward-training that the youths who have received training have already done in three areas:

- i. Recruiting and training other youths in new enterprises started after finishing training their artisan
- ii. Onward delivery of functional literacy training – both individuals that have taught siblings, and parents that have supported children’s schoolwork
- iii. Sharing information from the HIV/AIDS awareness and human rights training with families, friends and community members

This work enhances both the impact of the project’s work and extends its value-for-money as an investment into the future small-enterprise economy in Bo and Kenema regions.

“I am now seen as a role model in my community because I have skills. People want to be like me. I am inspiring other young people, female and male”

Female trainee

“As well as my catering training and business management training, I like the literacy training. Now I can check the books of my children and help with their school work”

Former female trainee, now running her own enterprise

ToR 3: IDENTIFY KEY CONTRIBUTING FACTORS WHICH HAVE ENHANCED AND/OR HINDERED THESE PROSPECTS

Outcome 1 trade skills training

Key factors identified through the evaluation process that collectively accounted for success of work on skills and business training in Outcome 1 are:

- Initial recruitment campaign – there was broad approach, including the use of local media to widely publicise the project and its aims in target areas
Government staff and other key local stakeholders were mobilised
Government to help publicise the project and identify suitable artisans and trainee
- Artisan selection criteria – only specialist workshops with training tools were chosen, who were already experienced in apprenticeships, registered with the council and had good customer turnover
- Strong MoUs were signed by CARD, artisans and trainees – care was taken for all to understand the contents of the MoU. The contents of the MoU were then strictly monitored and adhered to through the length of the project
- CARD staff project team initial approach to artisans and trainees. This reason was cited extensively as being critical to the project's success. CARD staff took a very "hands-on" monitoring and mentoring approach to establishing work in their zones. For example, in the early stages of training when potential for dropout was highest, staff would visit to trainees' homes if they were absent to ensure they attended training. They also required each trainee to have a "guarantor" who was given responsibility for the trainee to fully engage in the training process with their artisan
- The consistency and commitment of the CARD project staff throughout the life of the project was also mentioned by quite a few interviewees as a reason they knew the project was serious in supporting them. CARD zonal staff visited every artisan and trainee an average 3 times per week. The level of input and support has helped adhere commitment, trust and loyalty amongst many involved
- Trainees choosing from a menu of trade options – providing an element of choice enabled trainees to feel more committed to the trade they elected, rather than feeling forced to learn a trade skill because it was the only option open to them
- Artisans showing continued commitment to trainees. A number of artisans interviewed perceived their training of the youths as vocational calling as much as income generation for their businesses. A number expressed they had felt increased prestige and respect achieved for themselves as a result of taking on the CARD trainees
- Quarterly monitoring report progress helped give an overall view of the whole picture and allow adjustments to ensure the project remained on-track
- Business management training course and mentoring – this was very popular amongst interviewees and commented on extensively throughout interviews. The content was a combination of technical (book-keeping, records tracking) and group dynamics/leadership and trust work. The training was recalled by almost everyone interviewed who all commented on key things they had learnt. Topics cited most frequently were customer care, records management and nurturing positive group dynamics within the business.

- Support of local Government stakeholders to the programme – through the project steering committee they remained committed to monitoring the project's process and helped resolve specific issues as they arose
- Diversity – the project has achieved particular success with disabled people (people with physical impairments) in four of the project's zones. Some of the artisans recruited were disabled people – a point noted and commended by the evaluator as an example of disability inclusion in a mainstream project.
- Composition and pro-active involvement of the Project Management Steering Committees in each of the two regions (Bo and Kenema). Each was broad based in composition –trainees, artisans, project facilitators and local Government leaders – and effectively acted as external monitoring and evaluation support to the project's work through their six-monthly meetings during the project's life.

Reasons underlying success and challenges in incomes achieved by trainees

The evaluation process probed for reasons accounting for mixed success in area of project work (reported under indicator 1.2). They are complex and multi-faceted. The evaluator concludes the following reasons collectively account for mixed success of incomes achieved by trainees in the project:

Macro economic factors

- The project has operated against the backdrop of significant turbulence in the Sierra Leonean economy. Austerity started to be implemented 18 months ago. The outcome of the recent election, which has seen a new President elected on a strong agenda of economic reform and reducing national debt (which is expected to entail further austerity) is an indicator of the turbulence many Sierra Leoneans feel they have faced.
- Rapid inflation (18% per year during the project's life) and sharp devaluation of the SLL currency against the US dollar have meant raw materials needed for many of the 16 trade skills in the project have significantly increased in cost. This has impacted income and profit levels of the artisans and trainee-established businesses.
- Slow economic recovery process from the Ebola public health crisis of 2014-15. During the crisis schools shut and many businesses found it difficult to successfully operate. Deaths from Ebola affected family incomes and ability to achieve basic living standards. Stigma was attached to those who survived Ebola, and the families of those who experienced family member deaths to Ebola, impacting their earning potential in the short term.

CARD project factors – i. stipends and ii. loans

Consistently, the biggest challenge of the entire project cited by almost every stakeholder interviewed was the stipend amounts provided by the project (perceived as too low) and the toolkit loans/business loans component of work (too low to cover needs/loan arrears and defaults higher than expected). Some of the challenges of the loans are covered later in the report.

The main evaluator comment is that the stipends and loans aspects of project work seem to have taken up disproportionate amounts of project time and energies. It is important that appropriate lessons are taken forward from some of the admirable and ambitious ideas that underpinned the model used in this project, in order for CARD

to not face similar levels of energies and struggles invested into this area of project work in future.

CARD sought to make a few “leaps” at the same time through changing the delivery of stipends and loans provision compared to its previous projects. A key backdrop of this decision was that most other NGOs working in the same areas on youth skills training programmes continue to offer grants and higher levels of stipends:

- Changing from grants to loans, and from monthly to quarterly stipends. Amounts were deliberately set at lower levels to deter artisan/trainee interest in income from the project as the primary motivator for attendance. Setting amounts at lower levels was believed to be more conducive to nurturing entrepreneurial spirit and capacity. Also, the challenging project budget framework meant tough and clear choices needed to be made about where to best use grant funding received
- Piloting a collective responsibility approach between artisan and their trainees for toolkit loans to encourage repayments. Within this new approach was an assumption of strong trust between artisan and trainees – i.e. that the artisan would fully share the benefits with the trainees, and not to use the CARD trainees primarily to gain access to extra funds for themselves
- Trainees who were swapping unsafe income streams for mainstream trade skills. A significant sub-set of project’s trainees were encouraged to move out of vulnerable lifestyles that were paying them incomes from unsafe activities – especially commercial sex work, gang-related crime and begging. For those in this category participating in the project involved an initial income reduction compared to previous earnings, though with an incentive of stronger future income-earning prospects

The evaluator’s conclusion is these three simultaneous ambitious aims of CARD may have been more realistic and achievable to meet indicator 1.2 targets had the macro economic situation in Sierra Leone been more stable during the project’s lifespan –something CARD could not have foreseen when they started the project.

A pattern of defaulting on project loans started in the second year, largely due to a difficult seasonal economic period faced by artisans. However, once this started, the momentum for repayments started to be lost. In urban areas it is believed word started to spread about non-payments which fuelled a climate of non-repayments to spread faster. Staff have invested substantial and significant energies into getting loan repayments back on track, with a variety of methods and sanctions used. This is reflected in the numbers reported earlier in this section.

Possible under-reporting of incomes in sample survey

CARD staff believe the figures may have elements of under-reporting of income by project beneficiaries for multiple cultural reasons. Culturally, if true income figures are known by local community members then individuals can be targeted persistently for financial support for practical needs (above and beyond immediate dependants of the individual). Sierra Leone also has a widespread culture of tax evasion and avoidance – a specific issue the President who was newly elected in March 2018 has stated as a key issue to tackle the country’s economic challenges. Through the human rights training this project has promoted the importance of paying taxes, and a number of beneficiaries are reporting to now pay taxes on their increased incomes

and/or pay taxes where they previously would not have considered doing so. However, CARD staff felt people may have been reticent to have clearly stated their full incomes in order not to pay full taxes due on those formal and informal incomes.

Evaluator interviews that probed indicator 1.3 (below) would concur with the view of partial under-reporting of income, as many interviewees stated they did not have enough income for basic needs, yet many also stated they were managing to meet their basic needs without supplementary sources of income.

Gender discrepancies in income levels

Results show that young men are achieving higher incomes than young women, especially in the target USD68 and above per month rate- only 2% of sample survey females achieved above this level, as opposed to 15.5% of males. This could partly be linked to the trades chosen by trainees, which were generally viewed as “male” and “female” trade skill sets, rather than broad-based acceptance that men and women could culturally do all 16 equally. Some of these trades (e.g. motorbike mechanics) – the ones young men picked - are arguably generally more lucrative. Further, confidence levels to self-promote businesses and income-achieving value amongst young men and young women were noticeably different in a number of interviews – a number of the young male entrepreneurs were overtly more money and income focused compared to young women. This is largely accounted for by embedded cultural factors over gender roles in Sierra Leone society.

Outcome 2 life skills training

The project has been very successful in achieving its Outcome 2 targets, especially the components of delivering functional literacy training and HIV/AIDS awareness training. Targeted numbers to receive training have been substantially exceeded. This is because those trainings were opened to other interested youths who weren't part of the Outcome 1 skills training programme but expressed interest to attend, plus artisans. CARD took an open and inclusive approach to allowing people who would benefit to participate to extend the benefits and impact of its work.

Functional literacy

CARD clearly benefits from its Programme Manager's long-standing knowledge and association with the Pamoja network, that draws on the well-established REFLECT materials and methodologies. The FAL facilitator model used to deliver locally has clearly exceeded expected delivery achievements.

HIV/AIDS

The HIV/AIDS course content was adapted and simplified from national curriculum/IEC materials. It has some very hard-hitting information in it and, judging by the responses given to the evaluator on the changed behaviours of participants as a result on both sexual practices and sharing equipment must clearly have been delivered with a passion and drive to communicate the importance of prevention and protection measures for individuals.

Gender and human rights

The written materials available for this course were much briefer compared to others. The evaluator's review of course content was that materials didn't cover some core content topics on gender and female empowerment. Of all the course materials reviewed, the gender course had the least content and weakest messaging written down for course use.

The evaluator was told that more was covered verbally than was written down, though interviewee responses still leads to the suggestion/conclusion that there could be an issue with the effectiveness of the course content and delivery in achieving desired learner outcomes.

It was noted the course was delivered by a man (the same facilitator who delivered the highly effective HIV/AIDS awareness training). Standard practice is that gender training and information should be delivered by a woman, or at least co-delivery of a man and a woman.

The questions on gender discussed in the all-staff workshop suggest that CARD staff would benefit from greater training and support on gender components of future CARD work in this area. This is discussed further under the "Key Learning Points" section.

"To my surprise, the children who were wayward before the project have decided to focus on their trades. I am pleased for their determination, they are working in unity"

Rural village chief, Bo Region

Stipends and Loans

As raised in the commentary section on Outcome 1 achievements, stipends and loans amounts and ongoing problems faced by CARD staff in collecting loan repayments were both substantial challenges for the project. Problems with stipends and loans were universally raised by all project stakeholders through the evaluation interview process.

Issues/challenges cited include:

- Trainees received lunch and transport stipend for the first three months, then were expected to self-support. Trainees and artisans said the amount allowed was too low and for too short a period of time.
- Artisans received quarterly payments for the trainees instead of monthly payments. The level received for three months was generally what other NGOs pay artisans per month.
- Trainees wanted support at the end of the project for toolkits to start their businesses with. Some were tied into collective loans with their artisans and did not feel they had benefitted from them. Where those initial toolkit loans had not been repaid then they felt they did not get access to subsequent business loans and were unfairly penalised.
- All other NGOs working on youth skills training give stipends and grants to trainees, and at higher levels. Although it must be critically noted as a key point that many felt CARD's commitment and mentoring (rather than the "drop

and go” approach people mentioned about other NGOs) was very valuable and a reason why they stayed

- Artisans and trainees reported the amount they could access in toolkit loans was too low compared to the amount they needed to cover support needed for trainees learning needs and wastage/damage to materials
- The CARD Programme Manager cited that in their model for artisan selection, one criteria they did not include for this project was background financial checks on the artisans and their ability to manage money/repay credit. This is something that would be included in future iterations of this project model.
- Some trainees were being recruited/persuaded to join the project training scheme from unsafe income earning practices – especially commercial sex workers, gang members (who would commit theft), women relying on older men to “sponsor” them, and begging on the streets (especially disabled people). Therefore it was especially hard work initially to keep some committed in early stages of the project to training when their short-term incomes dropped sharply. It is testimony to the artisans and CARD staff that they kept all trainees motivated to continue, to the point they chose to stay without continual monitoring.
- A general culture of expecting handouts rather than loans within Sierra Leone, built up over decades of support from the NGO and Government sectors. Artisans and trainees knew they signed an MoU, but didn’t maybe expect CARD to follow through on it.

In addition to these points, the project operated in a context of ferociously challenging macro-economic conditions. These were post-Ebola economic recovery; substantial inflation and increases in raw material costs; and austerity. APT reported in their January 2018 trip report following a monitoring visit that

“CARD first noticed a pattern of defaulting during the rainy season of June-August 2016 when customers, orders and money are in short supply. While around half of these were able to recover and get back on track thanks to increased earnings over the dry season, others failed to do so, either at all or only slightly. The 2017 rainy season, compounded by a depressed economy with 18% inflation, austerity measures imposed by the government and a general uncertainty with forthcoming elections of March 2018 further exacerbated the problem”.

ToR 4: ASSESS THE PROJECT’S OVERALL PERFORMANCE IN TERMS OF RELEVANCE, EFFECTIVENESS, EFFICIENCY, ECONOMY (INCLUDING VALUE FOR MONEY) AND SUSTAINABILITY

Relevance

The project’s timeliness and relevance is unquestionable. The coincidental timing of its planning with the Ebola outbreak in Sierra Leone only served to increase its relevance due to the targeting of disaffected and disenfranchised youths in Sierra Leone, many who stopped (or had never started) education due to the public health crisis which had created a big short-term economic shock in Sierra Leone. A major national challenge is how to channel this segment of the population into productive,

tax-paying lifestyles. The new President of Sierra Leone has been elected on a platform of austerity and reducing the country's national debt.

The project's model has proved effective in reaching vulnerable individuals and transforming their lives. This can only bode well for their individual, family and communities' futures.

Economy and Efficiency

The budget for the project of GBP498,183 has been fully spent. Budget management has proved very tight in some areas.

For example, a current challenge is finding budget to formally "graduate" the second tranche of trainees who have completed the programme. Trainee graduation ceremonies are important for a number of reasons – enhancing self-empowerment of trainees; to widely publicise their trade skills to service providers in Bo and Kenema to enhance post-training employment and enterprise prospects; and to promote the work of CARD, APT and BLF in this sector (as youth skills and employment are a national priority for the Government).

Value for money

Per trainee unit cost of the project is GBP415 including all support by CARD and APT.

Comparing this to income being achieved by trainees (as reported in figures under indicator 1.2): Trainee incomes post-project have/will exceed this GBP415 unit cost between 5.5 months (for highest earners on USD105 per month) and 17.5 months (for lowest earners on USD33 per month) after training completion. For the majority of trainees earning USD45 per month or more (55%) they will exceed their unit project cost in incomes earned in 13 months or less having completed their training.

Two important components to acknowledge which enhance the project's achievement on its value-for-money beyond this are:

- Equity – equity is now recognised by most (including DFID¹) as the fourth "E" of value-for-money (with economy, efficiency and effectiveness). The project explicitly targeted young people facing inequality challenges to promote their economic and social advancement and has achieved well on this area
- Onward training delivery by trainees and artisans creating a "multiplier" effect. As reported in the impacts section, some trainees and artisans are already replicating skills training programmes. Many (especially women) further reported dissemination of life skills training content including functional literacy and HIV/AIDS prevention to their families and communities

Both of these components extend the value-for-money delivered by the project.

Effectiveness

As main project objectives have been largely achieved and over-achieved, this represents and exceeds the value-for money expected to be delivered from the project.

¹ <https://icai.independent.gov.uk/html-report/dfids-approach-to-value-for-money-in-programme-and-portfolio-management/>

The CARD project model of heavily investing in zonal Project Officers to guide and support artisans and trainees has yielded very good results and has been very significant in reaching and exceeding most project targets.

Sustainability

As trade, business and life skills training components of the project have achieved all their targets, the sustainability from this project can be regarded as strong and relatively robust. Once youths and their artisans have received and improved their knowledge and skills, that in itself is a sustainable outcome.

The project has delivered a solid basis for trainees to achieve sustainable future incomes to support the needs of themselves and their families. Indicator 1.2 income figures demonstrate this has not yet been achieved, and the current macro-economic conditions in Sierra Leone (as discussed in “Key Contributing Factors – Outcome 1 skills training” section) could present challenges on the timescale for achievement. These factors are beyond the control of CARD. The project has focused on building trainee economic resilience through the quality of skills training plus business management training courses (delivered through extensive mentoring support from project zonal officers).

Choosing to deliver rights and other life skills training alongside economic skills training will help vulnerable youths self-protect themselves in potential future situations of vulnerability they could face (especially around HIV/AIDS awareness and prevention). Should the economic climate improve, the youths have skills to help them capitalise on this. There is a clear challenge for how the youths will access tools and capital in future – CARD is expressing interest to consider more work in the area of micro-finance and how to enable trainees in their programmes to more effectively gain sustainable access to loans rather than via the NGO itself.

The unexpected changes reported show the project’s work has already achieved a degree of “multiplier” effect and extended its impact – this element in particular shows very promising signs of longer term sustainability of what has been delivered within the P188 project.

ToR 5: IDENTIFY KEY LEARNING POINTS AND MAKE RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FUTURE OPERATIONS OF THIS AND SIMILAR PROJECTS

Stipends and loans

Had the macro-economic conditions in Sierra Leone been more stable during the project period perhaps the ambitious simultaneous moves to loans (instead of grants) and lower stipend rates would have been smoother, given the other clear strengths of the CARD project model. However, the evaluator’s conclusion is potentially the project found itself with disproportionate challenges, which made it hard work for many stakeholders involved (including project staff)

An evaluation conclusion is that in hindsight it was probably too ambitious to introduce the amount of change in this aspect of project delivery compared to earlier approaches given the wide-ranging macro-economic challenges the project operated

in. The scale of macro-economic challenge could not have been reasonably expected to have been anticipated by CARD staff however.

Given the complexity of the whole issue, a focused learning review by APT and CARD on this challenging aspect of the project's delivery beyond what this evaluation process could achieve would be highly beneficial before proceeding to new phases of work. Some recommendations to consider based on evaluation findings are:

- Include financial background checks on artisans in future iterations
- Review the collective responsibility of artisans and trainees to repay loans – where trust existed between all it seemed to work; where trust was lacking between artisans it was more challenging
- Rename the “toolkit loan” to “training loan” to more accurately reflect its purpose – “toolkit loans” have strong associations with a particular type of support that is different to what was offered under this project
- Review appropriate levels/length for both stipends and loans

Gender considerations

The commitment of CARD's leadership to actively consider gender issues is highly commended. Cultural issues and attitudes towards women in Sierra Leone – especially the incidence of gender-based violence - were reported to be deeply embedded in Sierra Leonean society. A key learning point from this evaluation for CARD is their future project could advance this agenda further with some focused attention, as a couple of key gaps on it emerged during the evaluation process.

Gender-inclusive programming (as well as other social inclusion programming) has some well-worn paths it is recommended that CARD draws upon to strengthen its gender-inclusion work in future. The evaluator observed the following areas which could be strengthened:

Partnering with rights-based women's' groups

Partnering with rights-based women's' groups who have knowledge, skills and experience to train and support CARD should strengthen their knowledge and tools to effectively deliver in this area, based on successful approaches elsewhere.

Staff knowledge, approaches and attitudes towards gender

Socially-inclusive programming is a very sensitive area in development work. By nature, work to empower women and seek change will involve challenging widely accepted societal norms. Power dynamics change between women and men as they are empowered, which can feel threatening to men who can feel reduced power in their relationship dynamic with women. Identifying cultural “norms” that prevent the advancement of women is a starting point to seek change, and finding effective methods to shift cultural norms need to be specifically identified and implemented – for example, influencing faith-based leaders and community leaders with key messages as important influential voices in communities that affect general culture and individual attitudes.

In the staff workshop on the first day, the evaluator posed the same questions to gender segregated groups of staff about why the project chose to set a 40:60

Female – Male target, and why that target hadn't been fully achieved (especially as it was already less than 50:50). The feedback from the female group was broader, more nuanced, and showed a range of practical as well as cultural issues that women would face (e.g. covering childcare, male spousal jealousy of wives earning income). The men's' groups largely accounted for challenges as existing culture in society, greater male interest in learning trade skills, and women's "shyness" or lack of willingness to participate. Subsequently, cultural and religious issues were cited as a major constraint. Some female youths were excluded from the programme having applied as they were deemed either over-qualified or too young to be eligible.

It is known from studies of social work elsewhere that unless staff have appropriate personal understanding and attitudes aligned with project objectives and goals on gender and social inclusion, it is very hard to achieve them in practice.

It is recommended that any future project work starts with support to staff to understand the full breadth of gender issues and practical tools to help advance them in their spheres of responsibility, especially in areas where there are additional identified cultural barriers to female participation.

Review gender rights training materials

Of all the training materials the evaluator reviewed, the written gender and rights materials were relatively brief and showed key gaps on some standard gender concepts. The materials were developed and delivered by a man. However, it is understood more was covered in the training than was written down in the main materials.

The evaluation interviews yielded no or little spontaneous recall or impact of the gender components of the human rights training course across the vast majority of interviews. This was in significant contrast to the HIV/AIDS course (developed and delivered by the same male trainer) where there was high recall and many strong positive examples of changed behaviour volunteered without much prompting in most interviews. The written materials for the HIV/AIDS course were much longer, comprehensive and stronger.

The "light" course materials, poor recall by trainees of the course (especially the gender components) in stark comparison to strong recall of the HIV/AIDS course suggest the course would benefit from review of its content and delivery methodology. It was particularly stark how many male interviews failed to recall the course, and when prompted all but a few only remembered content relating to human rights issues that were not gender-specific.

This being said, there were some important changes reported in some interviews. Some disabled men interviewed cited change of behaviour towards their wives after the training (as they absorbed training room messages that they needed to care for their wives so they didn't leave them), a few non-disabled men said they learnt they should not beat their wives and so stopped (although one commented the loss of power at home as his wife was now empowered was a negative impact to him of the project's work), and some women interviewed had felt empowered from the messages they heard.

Disability considerations

It is to CARD and APT's great credit that they elected to have disability targets in their project design and delivery. Two of the four regional Government-appointed commissioners for disability in Sierra Leone were on project management steering committees (one in Bo, one in Kenema). Both commented that inclusion and interest of mainstream NGOs to pro-actively include disabled people in their work was still unfortunately rare in Sierra Leone, even though national policy and law now requires it. CARD's commitment to this area has therefore been noted by them and stands out in strong comparison to other NGOs in Bo and Kenema. Recruiting disabled artisans as part of the project delivery is especially noted and commended by the evaluator as an innovation which fits well with disability mainstreaming principles.

From interviews with disabled people during the field visit, it was clear there have been a number of positive impacts on their lives – more so for men than women - though these impacts have generally not been as far-reaching compared to non-disabled participants. The reasons discerned during interviews seem to be linked due to societal-attitude and practical (access) impairment-related challenges. There were some good experiences shared in interviews on positive impacts from the process of being involved in the CARD project and earning some income – especially moving away from begging, ability to self-support on basic needs (partial in a number of cases, especially women), greater self-respect and acceptance by families/communities due to incomes earned, reduced sexual exploitation and abuse of disabled women.

In this project, CARD elected to focus on people with physical impairments for inclusion. Partly as the main method for inclusion of disabled people was via two training institutes focused on people with physical impairments – OTC in Kenema and DRIM in Bo, partly due to practical access reasons cited by project staff.

There was a noticeable difference in confidence and attitude for the future between disabled men and disabled women who were interviewed by the evaluator. This reflects general findings on disability inclusion work – that gender issues also impact those with impairments. Women with impairments face “double discrimination” – on the basis of their impairment, and their gender.

One issue raised in an APT trip report of this approach was transition from disabled people receiving training in disability-focused institutes to general market-place work and self-employment. This issue was partly probed during evaluation interviews. The disabled men interviewed communicated relatively more confidence, ambition and plans to start their own businesses – when financing opportunities may allow them to (all currently remain with their training institute). The women had a desire to be self-employed, but less evident planning and drive, and some perceived substantial objections to progressing employment ambitions. All those interviewed remained with their artisan, partly in the hope of further opportunities being offered to them to use their new trade skills, also significantly for the social support and contact with others who accepted and supported them – something largely lacking in their lives before this project.

The evaluator's overall comment is to highly commend CARD for their efforts through this work. Should future phases and opportunities allow, it is recommended CARD extends reach to other impairments beyond those with physical impairments. Should CARD continue to support disability-specific institutions as the main pathway for training disabled people in trade skills, it is recommended that CARD consider how to pro-actively translate vocational training skills acquired by disabled people into mainstream marketplace income-generating work. Disabled people have additional legitimate challenges faced in gaining income beyond skills training – including negative consumer attitudes and additional access challenges. Both would benefit and require focused attention in future projects.

“My family used to call me a curse, but now with the training I am consulted, even the community have respect for me since the community can't do what I can do now”

Female youth with disability

“I used to sleep in slums before the training. Now I pay rent, I have brought home a child, my child is even going to school”

Male youth with disability

Recommendations for Future Work

Recommendations from Outcome 1

- **Most of the skills training model is strong** re. CARD selection and recruitment criteria for artisans and trainees; good project launch and publicity; strong support from relevant local Government departments; and strong performance by CARD project staff on intensive local management, mentoring and monitoring work. **Replication is recommended as funding opportunities allow.**
- **A review is recommended on participation and engagement levels of female youths and achieving more impact from gender rights training. It is recommended that CARD seeks to learn from and partner with women's groups** who are representative of, and have successful experience in, female participation and a strong practical approach to gender empowerment. (During interviews the Bo Youth Commissioner mentioned a local organisation who may be suitable).
- **The stipends and loans element of the model would benefit from review** and reflection before future work is implemented. Some specific recommendations for consideration in the review are:
 - **Include financial background checks on artisans** in future iterations
 - **Review the collective responsibility of artisans and trainees to repay loans** – where trust existed between all it seemed to work; where trust was lacking between artisans it was more challenging)
 - **Rename the “toolkit loan” to “training loan”** to more accurately reflect its purpose – “toolkit loans” have strong associations with a particular type of support that is different to what was offered under this project
 - **Review appropriate levels/length for both stipends and loans**

Recommendations for Outcome 2 re. increasing gender equity

- **Review the gender and human rights training materials**, to ensure they are consistent with standard best practice on gender aspects

- **Partner with a representative group of women's rights and empowerment for advice and input** on best ways to design and deliver training.
- **Train and support staff** on gender rights and inclusion issues as foundational to implementing future gender empowerment and female participation in CARD programmes

Recommendations re. extending disability inclusion

- In future phases of work **extend opportunities beyond people with physical impairments** (hearing, visual, intellectual)
- Identify activities to **mitigate and eliminate attitude and access barriers to help disabled people move into successful employment or businesses beyond skills training** and other mentoring support
- Identify and **mitigate additional gender considerations for women with impairments**

APPENDIX 1 – Outcome 2 indicators – detailed markers information

Outcome 2: Vulnerable youths will have improved life skills, including HIV/AIDS awareness, functional literacy, rights and gender awareness, leading to improved opportunities and personal empowerment

Indicator	Baseline knowledge	Achievement	Data source
2.1: 1,200 young women and men (480 female & 720 male) with better understanding/awareness of HIV/AIDS, health and safety, gender rights and obligations (compared to the baseline)		2,849 people (895 female & 1,954 male) with better understanding of HIV/AIDS, gender rights & obligations and 1,200 (424 female & 776 male) with better understanding of occupational health & safety	Quarterly updates
2.1a: 1,200 young women and men (480 female & 720 male) with better understanding/awareness of HIV/AIDS transmission (compared to the baseline)	Signs & symptoms = 21% Prevention = 27% Transmission = 27%	2,849 people (895 female & 1,954 male) with better understanding of HIV/AIDS. Measurement markers: Knowledge <u>Signs and symptoms:</u> Female-603 (67%); Male – 1325 (68%) <u>Causes</u> Female –817 (91%); Male –1794 (92%) <u>Mode of transmission</u> Female – 865 (97%); Male – 1870 (96%) <u>Prevention</u> Female -847 (95%); Male –1813 (93%) Uses/impact on behaviour change <u>Now Use condom</u> Female –807 (90%); Male –1823 (93%) <u>Avoid multiple partners</u> Female –827 (92%); Male-1757 (90%)	Monthly reports - HIV/AIDS focal person Sample survey

Indicator	Baseline knowledge	Achievement	Data source
		<u>Avoid sharing of used razor blade</u> Female –885 (99%); Male – 1917 (98%) <u>Avoid sharing of needle</u> Female –847 (95%); Male -1870 (96%)	
2.1b: 1,200 young women and men (480 female & 720 male) with better understanding/awareness of health and safety (compared to the baseline)	Baseline level of understanding/awareness of occupational health and safety = 0	1,200 people (424 female & 776 male) with better understanding of occupational health & safety Awareness and Knowledge <u>Better understand -occupational safety</u> Female –420 (99%); Male –768 (99%) <u>Better understand occupational health</u> Female -424 (100%); Male –753 (97%) Uses/impact on behaviour change <u>Clean environment including workshop</u> Female –416 (98%); Male –768 (99%) <u>Use safety gears at work</u> Female –377 (89%); Male –691 (89%) <u>Clean working tools</u> Female- 246 (58%); Male –590 (76%) <u>Avoid burning of waste</u> Female –352 (83%); Male –598 (77%) <u>Use tools appropriately and responsibly</u> Female –369 (87%); Male –745 (96%)	Reports of Zonal Officers Sample survey
2.1c: 1,200 young women and men (480 female & 720 male) with better understanding of their rights and obligations (particularly gender)	Baseline level of understanding of gender rights and obligations: awareness of women rights generally good; awareness of obligations poor	2,849 people (895 female & 1,954 male) with better understanding of gender rights & obligations Knowledge and awareness <u>Understand what gender means</u> Female –626 (70%); Male –1381 (71%) <u>Understand what rights mean</u> Female -796 (89%); Male –1869 (96%)	Report of HIV/AIDS Focal person, Quarterly reports

Indicator	Baseline knowledge	Achievement	Data source
		<p><u>Understand my role and responsibilities as a citizen</u> Female –826 (92%); Male –1817 (93%)</p> <p><u>Understand what gender based violence means</u> Female –760 (85%); Male – 1445 (74%)</p> <p>Use/impact on behaviour change</p> <p><u>Voted last election</u> Female –875 (98%); Male –1934 (99%)</p> <p><u>Pay local tax</u> Female –749 (84%); Male – 1670 (85.5%)</p> <p><u>Send child(ren) to school</u> Female-788 (88%); Male –1406 (72%)</p> <p><u>Obey community and other laws</u> Female –875 (98%); Male –1914 (98%)</p> <p><u>Pay business tax</u> Female –399 (45%); Male -1621 (83%)</p>	
2.2: 840 young women and men (350 female & 490 male) with functional literacy	None	<p>2,206 people (655 female & 1,551 male) with functional literacy</p> <p>Knowledge gained from literacy classes</p> <p><u>Able to read and write the alphabet (A-Z)</u> Female-623 (96%); Male –1444 (93%)</p> <p><u>Able to read and write from 0-100</u> Female –635 (97%); Male –1535 (99%)</p> <p><u>Able to read two letter words</u> Female-622 (95%); Male –1442 (93%)</p> <p><u>Able to write my name</u> Female –623 (96%); Male –1442 (93%)</p> <p><u>Able to sign my name</u> Female –570 (87%); Male –1380 (89%)</p> <p>Use/impacts on behaviour change</p>	<p>Reports of FAL Facilitators for attendance</p> <p>Sample surveys for knowledge and application</p> <p>Test scripts</p>

Indicator	Baseline knowledge	Achievement	Data source
		<u>Able to call working tools by their names correctly</u> Female –642 (98%); Male –1508 (97%) <u>Able to take correct measurement</u> Female –557 (85%); Male –1380 (89%) <u>Do correct purchase of materials</u> Female –655 (100%); Male –1458 (94%) <u>Able to do basic calculations</u> Female –472 (72%); Male –1088 (70%) <u>Able to keep basic records</u> Female –465 (71%); Male –1026 (66%) <u>Provide back-up to children at home</u> Female –601 (92%); Male -886 (57%)	of FAL participants
2.3: 400 women and 540 men with improved opportunities and greater sense of self-respect demonstrated by reporting greater independence and participation by the end of the project	<i>NB: Although the indicator only states young women, it clearly expects 400 women and 540 men to benefit.</i>	Yr3: 937 people (368 female & 569 male) reporting improved opportunities, greater independence and/or participation with 369 documented examples from women <u>Participation in decision making/taking in families</u> Female –364 (99%); Male-552 (97%) <u>Participate in community decision making/taking</u> Female –195 (53%); Male- 376 (66%) <u>Represent community at other levels</u> Female –169 (46%); Male –185 (50%) <u>Hold key community position (youth leade, chair etc)</u> Female –96 (26%); Male –176 (31%) <u>Mobilize, manage and control own resources</u> Female –337 (92%); Male – 952 (97%) <u>Have own spouse and family</u> Female –239 (65%); Male –376 (66%) <u>Now speak in public without being shy</u>	Sample survey

Indicator	Baseline knowledge	Achievement	Data source
		Female –368 (100%); Male-563 (99%) <u>Owned self/group enterprise</u> Female –125 (34%); Male -239 (42%)	
2.3a 400 young women reporting improved opportunities and a greater sense of self-respect through greater equality with their male counterparts, e.g. in terms of income by the end of the project	N/A	369 documented examples of women reporting improved opportunities and/or enhanced self-respect, although all 424 believed to have benefited <u>Able to compete for jobs</u> Female –399 (94%); Male-529 (93%) <u>Have Diversify income source</u> Female –373 (88%); Male – 455 (80%) <u>Gained self- esteem/respect</u> Female –369 (87%); Male –501 (88%) <u>Gained improved status in society</u> Female – 411 (97%); Male –546 (96%) <u>Self-reliant (free from depending on others)</u> female –335 (79%); Male – 523 (92%)	Sample survey
2.3b 400 women and 540 men reporting greater independence and participation as a result of improved opportunities	N/A	937 (368 female & 569 male) reporting improved opportunities, greater independence and/or participation as per 2.3a indicator results	Quarterly reports Sample survey

APPENDIX 2 –Enterprises established by project trainees (end March 2018)

SUMMARY TABLE

District and Zone	Number of Group Enterprises	Group Composition		Number of Individual Enterprises	Group composition	
		Male	Female		Male	Female
Bo Zone 1	9	7	18	8	2	6
Bo Zone 2	3	9	0	1	1	0
Bo Zone 3	20	26	32	9	0	9
District Totals	31	42	50	18	3	15
Kenema Zone 1	12	19	13	13	6	7
Kenema Zone 2	11	29	14	2	1	1
Kenema Zone 3	2	4	0	7	4	3
District Totals	25	52	27	22	11	11
Grand Total	56	94	77	40	14	26

List of enterprises established by trade skill:

Type of enterprise	Group enterprises	Individual enterprises
Catering	3	4
Hairdressing	11	16
Tin smith	10	1
Embroidery	3	2
Carpentry	11	
Motorcycle mechanic	4	1
Metalwork	1	3
Mobile phone repair	1	3
Auto-mechanic	1	1
Tailoring	7	4
Auto electrician	2	
Panel beating and spraying	1	
Weaving	1	1
Fridge mechanic		1
Electronics		3

APPENDIX 3 – Evaluation timetable

23RD-30TH April 2018

Day & Date	Activity /Session	Comment
Sunday 22nd April 2018	Arrival at Lungi	
Monday 23 rd April 2018	<p>Morning Session Collect Sue at Lungi Hotel to Bo</p> <p>Afternoon Session Workshop with staff – 9 staff (6 male, 3 female)</p>	<p>-Gandi</p> <p>-Accountant & Coordinator to make arrangements</p>
KENEMA DISTRICT		
Tuesday 24 th April 2018 9:00 am -12 noon	<p>Morning Session Meet with:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Disabled Male (OTC) –staying with Artisan (4 trainees) 2. Disabled female(OTC)-staying with Artisan (3 trainees) 3. Non- disabled Male-Staying with Artisan United Brothers (2 trainees, 1 artisan) 4. Non-disabled Female-staying with artisan (1 artisan, 6 trainees) 	<p>Take off time from Bo - 8:00am Electronics & Tin smithing</p> <p>Embroidery & Tailoring Tailoring Aminata Koroma: Hairdressing (Hamid H/D Saloon)</p>
12:00 Noon – 1:00 Pm	LUNCH	
1:00Pm – 4:30 Pm	<p>Afternoon Session- Self Employed Youth:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Male: Japan garage (3 trainees) 2. Female: Embroidery (1 trainee) 3. Female Hairdressing (1 artisan, 3 trainees) 	<p>Bike mechanics</p> <p>C-Curve</p> <p>Sombo street</p>
KENEMA DISTRICT		
Wednesday 25th April 9:00 am -10:30 am	<p>Morning Session Meet with Steering Committee Members 13 people:10 male (2 PWD), 3 female</p>	<p>Take off time from Bo - 8:00am - Gbessay,2 Trainees, DYC,OTC Rep, Ndoeka, Iris, FAL Facilitators</p>
10:30 am – 12:00 Noon	<p>Meet stakeholders/Line Ministries 2 male (1 PWD) – disability commissioner, youth commissioner</p>	<p>-Gender Ministry</p> <p>-Commissions: Disability & Youth</p>
12:00 Noon - 1:00 Pm	LUNCH	
1:00 Pm -4:30 Pm	<p>Afternoon Session</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Meet with Local Chiefs 2 people (1 male, 1 female) - Successful Artisan (1 male) 	<p>-Hangha</p> <p>-Japan Garage</p>
BO DISTRICT		
Thursday 26th April 2018 9:00 am – 11:00 am	<p>Morning Session: Meet with: Non-disabled male- Self-employed (1 artisan, 3 trainee)</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Non-disabled Female- –Self employed (1 trainee) 	<p>Capon (Gerald-Electronics)</p> <p>-Jamie Robbin</p>

11:am -12:00 Noon	2. Meet with Stakeholders/Line Ministries & Steering Committee Members 10 people: 8 male, 2 female (1 PWD)	- Ministry of Labour & Social Security & Ministry of Youth - Councillor, Gender Supervisor, FAL facilitators
12:00 Noon – 1:00 Pm	LUNCH	
1:00 Pm -3:30 Pm	Afternoon Session Meet with: 1. Disabled male staying with Artisan (5 trainees) 2. Disabled Female staying with Artisan (7 trainees)	- DRIM - DRIM
3:30Pm -5:00 Pm	Afternoon Session Meet with: 3. Successful Artisan (2 male artisans) 4. Less Successful Artisan (3 male trainees – their artisan died on their day of graduation)	Joseph Bangalie Garage -Lahai Makaya
Friday 27th April 2018	Public Holiday Meet with Gandhi to review and confirm quantitative data numbers provided and clarify some points arising	Doha's Hotel
Saturday 28th April 2018 9:00 am -12 :00 Noon	Morning Session Meet with: 1. Local Chiefs (3 male) 2. Business groups-(4 groups) Weavers–female (3 trainees, 1 artisan) Hairdressing – female (2 trainees, 1 artisan) Motorcycle mechanic – male (3 trainees, 1 artisan)	Take –off time from Bo: 8:30am --Gerihun -Motor-cycle Mechanic(1group) -Weaving group (2 groups) -Hairdressing (1 group)
12:00-1:00Pm	LUNCH	
1:00 Pm -5:00Pm	Afternoon Session Meet with: 1. Non-disabled Male staying with Artisan (3 trainees, 1 artisan) 2. Non-disabled Female staying with Artisan (4 trainees, 1 artisan)	- Komba James - Elizabeth Cowray
Monday 30th April	Meeting with staff-CARD Office 9 staff (6 male, 3 female)	8:00 am- 10:00 am

APPENDIX 4 – List of people interviewed

The following list of names interviewed has been additionally provided at APT's request for inclusion in evaluation documentation:

CARD staff (workshops on 23 and 30 April 2018)

Sagestine Gandi, Programme Manager (male)
Bernadette Massaquoi, Project Coordinator (female)
Luciatu Y Mattia, Field Officer (female)
Rosaline Kaifala, Field Officer (female)
Isaac B Charley, M&E Officer (male)
Abu Badarr Konuwa, Field Officer (male)
Mustapha U Sheriff, Field Officer (male)
Francis Noah Ngegba, Field Officer (male)
Abdulai Mansaray, Field Offer (male)

Project Steering Committee – Kenema

Fatmata Nyama, Trainee - tailoring (female)
Gbessay Moseray, Artisan - Metal work artisan/FAL facilitator (male)
Jeremaiah Gbetu, Artisan – tailoring/FAL facilitator (male)
Jerahim Mansaray, Trainee – electrical/electronics (male)
Abdul Karim Allieu, FAL facilitator (male)
Foday Sillo, FAL facilitator (male)
Umaru Massaquoi, FAL facilitator (male)
Edward J Mammy, Artisan - Principal OTC (male)
Mariama Mansaray, Artisan – tailoring (female)
Irish Tutangay, Artisan – hairdressing (female)
Lansana Ndoeka, Artisan – tailoring (female)
Emmanuel Farma, District Youth committee (male) – Chair of Committee
Ibrahim Kawa, FAL facilitator (male)

Project Steering Committee and Line Ministries – Bo

Kenei Lausana Momah, FAL facilitator (male)
Councillor Joseph Foday, Councillor – Bo City Council, youth chairperson (male)
Kabba P Sesay, Youth Commissioner – South (male)
Habib T Kappia, Employment Officer Ministry of Labour and Social security (male)
Sheku Fillie, Trainee – motor mechanic (male)
Rosaline Belmoh, Artisan – tailoring (disabled female)
Massa Komeh, Trainee – hairdressing (female)
Alfred Sandi, Gender Supervisor (male)
Anthony Kaitibie, District Youth Officer – South (male)

Government staff and Village Leaders

John Coutheh, Regional Disability Commissioner – South (disabled male)
Eku Scotland, Regional Disability Commissioner – East (disabled male)
Emmanuel Farma, Chairman – Kenema District Youth Council (male)
Aminata Jallo – female leader in Hangha village (female)
Jeremiah Gdeto – chief's representative, Hangha village (male)
Josei Lahai, Town Chief Gerehun (male)

Lahai Benya, Leader in Gerehun (male)
John Koroma, Leader in Gerehun (male)

Artisans and Trainees – Kenema

John Foday, Trainee – tinsmithing (disabled male)
Mohamed B Sesay, Trainee – tinsmithing (disabled male)
Aruna Kamara, Trainee – metalwork (disabled male)
Keifala Kanraro, Trainee – metalwork (disabled male)
Fatmata Lahai, Trainee – embroidery (disabled female)
Isafa Kemokai, Trainee – embroidery (disabled female)
Musu Momoh, Trainee – tailoring (female)
Hanusa Mansaray, Artisan – hairdressing and 6 of her trainees (female)
Richard Brina, Trainee - motorcycle mechanic (male)
Ibrahim Fomba, Trainee - motorcycle mechanic (male)
Somoh Mosnena, Trainee - motorcycle mechanic (male)
Beatric Jeneba Joiah, Trainee – embroidery (female)
Artisan – hairdressing and 4 of her trainees (female)
Artisan – tailoring and 2 of his trainees (male)
Augustine Moiwo – Artisan - motorcycle mechanic (male)
Ibrahim Foday – Artisan assistant – motorcycle mechanic (male)

Artisans and Trainees – Bo

Sandu Confeh, Trainee – mobile phone repairs/electronics (male)
Amadu Fofamah, Trainee – mobile phone repairs/electronics (male)
Mohamed M Sandi, Trainee – mobile phone repairs/electronics (male)
Gerald M Kpana, Artisan – mobile phone repairs/electronics
Jamie Robbin, Trainee – catering (female)
DRIM: 7 disabled female trainees – tailoring x 2, weaving x 2, embroidery x 2,
hairdressing x 1, 1 training artisan (female)
DRIM: 5 disabled male trainees – carpentry x 2, tinsmithing x 2, tailoring x 1, 1
training artisan (male)
Joseph Bangalie, Artisan – motor mechanic (male)
Vandy Swaray, Artisan – panel beating & spraying (male)
Lansama Makaya, Trainee – tinsmithing (male)
Mohamed M Sesay, Trainee – tinsmithing (male)
Digi Karim, Trainee – tinsmithing (male)
Fatmata Williams, Artisan – weaving (female)
Isata Vibie, Artisan – hairdressing (female)
Mariana Denby, Trainee – weaving (female)
Emma Kamu, Trainee – weaving (female)
Iestina Gormoh, Trainee – weaving (female)
Tenneh Karim, Trainee – hairdressing (female)
Amimata Manfaye, Trainee – hairdressing (female)
Allen M Denby, Artisan – motorbike mechanic (male)
Peter Mamma, Trainee – motorbike mechanic (male)
Amidu Koroma, Trainee – motorbike mechanic (male)
Trainee – motorbike mechanic (male)
James Komba, Artisan – motorbike mechanic (male)
Patrick Kamara, Trainee – motorbike mechanic (male)
Tamba Fidel, Trainee – motorbike mechanic (male)

Abdullah, Trainee – motorbike mechanic (male)
4 x Trainees – hairdressing (female)

APPENDIX 5 – Evaluation visit questions and stakeholder interview list

All-staff workshop questions

Write on individual pieces of paper – Name; Job title; How long you have worked in CARD

Answer individually on pieces of paper:

“In your opinion

1. What have been the main achievements/successes of the project?
2. Why/what factors are the reasons for the achievements/successes?”

Discuss in pairs. Sue to capture pair work discussion feedback on flipchart

Same process again for following questions

3. What have been the biggest challenges/unexpected things that have happened in the project?
4. Why/what are the reasons for these challenges/unexpected things?

Final group discussions – in gender-specific groups (2 male groups, 1 female group)

5. Gender balance of the project. The target was 40% female/60% male. This has not quite been achieved. In your opinion what are the reasons why the full target of females wasn't recruited and retained in the project? Gender specific discussion groups

Key Informant Interviews and Focus Group Discussion questions for field interviews

Intro info: Name, Location, Age (if relevant to ask – for the youth trainees in the project)

QUESTIONS TO BUSINESSES

- How many trainees have you taken on?
- Why did you decide to apply to join this programme as a training artisan?
- What was your turnover before you took on trainees? What is it now? Have your profits increased? By how much? Do you think there is a link between the change in your turnover and profit and taking on the trainees?
- Other than income, have you noticed other changes in your business because of having the trainees with you (both expected and unexpected)?
- Do you think there have been any differences to the community because of the CARD project?
- What has been good for you about having the trainees and participating in the CARD project?
- What has been challenging about having the trainees and participating in the CARD project?
- What happened at the end of the CARD supported training course – did you keep trainees as staff? Why? Why not? If the trainees were retained
- What are your plans for the future? Has participating in the CARD project helped? How?

QUESTIONS TO TRAINEES

- What was your life situation before you joined the programme?
- Why did you want to join the programme?

Outcome 1 questions – trade skills training

- What trade did you choose? Why?
- What have you learnt in the programme?
- What was good in the programme?

- What was difficult in the programme?
- What happened at the end of the programme? Did you continue working? Where? What influenced your choice on where to work (employed or self-employed) at the end of the programme?
- What difference/impact has being in the programme made to i. you ii. your family? Given practical examples (income and non-income).
- What have you done with the extra income you have received – give examples?
- Is your income enough to meet your basic needs? If not what happens to meet those basic needs? Give examples of what the income you have gained from your employment pays for, that you could not pay for before.
- What do you plan to do in the future with the skills you have learnt through being in this programme?

Outcome 2 questions - life skills training.

- Life skills training – what did you learn?
- What was most useful/most memorable in the training?
- What have you used?
- What difference has it made? Have you changed your practices/behaviours as a result of the training? Have you influenced others to change their knowledge, attitudes and practices as a result of the training you received? If yes – who, how many, when etc.?
(Sue – identify whether the target has been exceeded beyond better understanding/awareness on their rights and obligations to changed attitudes and practices in the 4 areas).

Do you think there have been any differences to the community because you have been in the programme? What?

QUESTIONS TO COMMUNITY LEADERS. STEERING COMMITTEE MEMBERS, GOVERNMENT STAFF

- What was the situation in your community before the project started?
- What is your involvement with the CARD project? Why did you want to be involved?
- What has the project done in your community?
- What has gone well?
- What has been challenging?
- What differences has the project made to your community (positive and negative)? Please give examples
- Have there been any unexpected changes in your community you've noticed as a result of the project's work (both economic skills and life skills training)? Why do you think they happened?

People to interview

Artisans in each locations

- Training artisans - selection of those who have been successful/ less successful with trainees
- Artisans who've recruited trainees from training artisans post-training (if available)

Trainees in each location

- Selection of trainees who have completed training and sought work beyond the course (non-disabled male, non-disabled female, disabled male, disabled female)
- Trainees who have completed training in the 3 categories of remaining with their artisan, self-employed, and gone to work for another employer (not their training artisan) – both successful and less successful.

- Trainees who did not find jobs or start their own businesses after their training if they are available and willing to be interviewed.

Local leaders

Village leaders/village committee in rural areas, Ministry of Labour/Ministry of Youth in urban areas as they were involved in project set-up. Appropriate stakeholders who can comment on project selection, implementation and the impact the project has had on the locality

OTHERS

Project Management Committees in Bo and Kenema

Ministry of Labour and Social Security (re selection of artisans)

CARD director – by Skype call the week before my visit, with a follow-up discussion during the visit

CARD project staff

- Workshop – afternoon of Monday 23rd April
- Evaluation feedback workshop to CARD staff – first part of morning Monday 30 April.

Any other suitable stakeholders you know who can comment on the impact of the project in the location

Recommendations from Outcome 1

Outcome 1

- **Most of the skills training model is strong re. CARD selection and recruitment criteria for artisans and trainees; good project launch and publicity; strong support from relevant local Government departments; and strong performance by CARD project staff on intensive local management, mentoring and monitoring work. Replication is recommended as funding opportunities allow.**

Accepted. Many of the components, relevant learning and experience from this project have already been included in subsequent proposals, including applications to DFID's Leave No Girls Behind and the EU CSO-LA thematic programme, the latter of which has recently been provisionally approved.

- **A review is recommended on participation and engagement levels of female youths and achieving more impact from gender rights training. It is recommended that CARD seeks to learn from and partner with women's' groups who are representative of, and have successful experience in, female participation and a strong practical approach to gender empowerment.**

Accepted. The forthcoming "Enhancing CSOs' capacities for more inclusive governance and development processes in Kenema District" project working together with women's rights organisation MUWODA Kenema as part of the EU CSO-LA thematic programme provides just this opportunity.

- **The stipends and loans element of the model would benefit from review and reflection before future work is implemented. Some specific recommendations for consideration in the review are:**
 - **Include financial background checks on artisans in future iterations**

Accepted, although in future toolkit loans will be provided upon evidence of need rather than offered as a standard package. While there is little scope for formal financial background checks, there are a range of strategies that can and will be deployed in future projects in order to assess the potential borrowers ability to repay. These include checking whether they keep records of income and expenditure and if so, the quality, reliability and accuracy of these. Other steps will include asking whether they have taken a loan before and successfully repaid it and if so, asking for documentary evidence. The lender will also be contacted for corroboration. Other options include ascertaining whether they receive materials and other supplies on credit or hire purchase and if so, whether their obligations have been met by checking their records as well as with the creditor. Another option is to assess whether there are any assets that might have potential for collateral.

- **Review the collective responsibility of artisans and trainees to repay loans – where trust existed between all it seemed to work; where trust was lacking between artisans it was more challenging)**

Accepted. Much of this is about better enforcement of the planned system. In this project, the intention was that the four trainees were collectively responsible for

repaying the loan, with the artisan as the guarantor. Instead, different enterprises used different methods: in some cases, the four trainees were exclusively responsible for repayments; in others, the artisan took exclusive responsibility; in some, this responsibility was shared between the trainees and artisans; while elsewhere, trainees, artisan and other employees took joint responsibility. In future, any training loans will be a joint responsibility of the four trainees and artisan and this expectation will be strongly emphasised to ensure greater clarity as well as be more rigorously enforced. All new loans will also require a neutral guarantor.

- **Rename the “toolkit loan” to “training loan” to more accurately reflect its purpose – “toolkit loans” have strong associations with a particular type of support that is different to what was offered under this project**

Accepted. A “training loan” does indeed provide a more accurate description of what is being offered as well as a greater emphasis on the whole package and not just the tools and materials.

- **Review appropriate levels/length for both stipends and loans**

Accepted. In this project, trainees received a stipend of SLL20K per month for the first three months, the logic being that since most trainees were not working before, they needed money at the outset to cover transport and lunch costs while after three months they should be earning enough to cover this themselves. However, this amount is simply inadequate at today’s costs and as such, any new project will increase the trainee stipend to SLL50K per month and for at least 50% of the training period. Artisans were paid SLL50K per month (SLL12.5K per trainee) paid on a quarterly basis for the full duration of training. Again, with rampant inflation, this will increase to SLL100K per month throughout the training period, but paid monthly rather than quarterly. The terms and conditions of the training (formerly toolkit) loan will remain unchanged: repayable over the duration of training and at a rate of 5% interest per annum. Business loans will also remain unchanged, ranging between six and 12 months depending on amount borrowed and the affordability of monthly repayments with an interest rate of 20% per annum.

Recommendations for Outcome 2 re. increasing gender equity

- **Review the gender and human rights training materials, to ensure they are consistent with standard best practice on gender aspects**
- **Partner with a representative group of women’s rights and empowerment for advice and input on best ways to design and deliver training.**
- **Train and support staff on gender rights and inclusion issues as foundational to implementing future gender empowerment and female participation in CARD programmes**

All three related recommendations are accepted and the forthcoming “Enhancing CSOs’ capacities for more inclusive governance and development processes in Kenema District” project working together with MUWODA Kenema as part of the EU CSO-LA thematic programme provides just this opportunity.

Recommendations re. extending disability inclusion

- **In future phases of work extend opportunities beyond people with physical impairments (hearing, visual, intellectual)**

Accepted. This project was CARD's first formal experience of including disabled people and while these were inevitably those easiest to access and support, the experience and success has generated the confidence to move beyond people with physical/mobility impairments to others with more complex needs in future projects.

- **Identify activities to mitigate and eliminate attitude and access barriers to help disabled people move into successful employment or businesses beyond skills training and other mentoring support**

Accepted and already starting to be put into practice. Two members of the CARD project team attended workshops on disability equality and disability mainstreaming at fellow APT local partner MAPCO in May 2018 and will be sharing their learning with their colleagues so that future projects such as the forthcoming project under the EU CSO-LA thematic programme can become more accessible to, and inclusive of, disabled women and men with a range of impairments.

- **Identify and mitigate additional gender considerations for women with impairments**

Accepted. The combination of practical engagement with women's rights organisations such as MUWODA in the forthcoming EU CSO-LA project together with CARD's recently acquired inputs on disability equality and mainstreaming should enable both organisations to better identify the rights, needs and concerns of disabled women with a range of impairments and from that, plan how to address this holistically.